

Performance, Finance and Customer Focus Overview and Scrutiny Committee – Call In

Wednesday 31 October 2018

PRESENT:

Councillor Winter, Vice Chair, in the Chair.

Councillor Fletcher (Substitute for Councillor Kelly), Vice Chair.

Councillors Corvid (Substitute for Councillor Vincent), Derrick, Dr Mahony (Substitute Councillor Ball), Morris (Substitute for Councillor Kate Taylor), Singh and Rebecca Smith.

Apologies for absence: Councillors Ball, Kelly, Kate Taylor and Vincent.

Also in attendance: Councillor Ball (Member Calling in Decision), Robin Bevan (Transport Planning Officer), Councillor Coker (Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning and Infrastructure), Councillor Dann (Cabinet Member for Environment and Street Scene), Sally Farley (Strategic Transport Manager), Ross Jago (Senior Governance Advisor), Councillor Johnson (Member Calling in Decision), Darren Stoneman (Civil Enforcement Manager) and Helen Prendergast (Democratic Advisor).

The meeting started at 3.30 pm and finished at 5.05 pm.

Note: At a future meeting, the Panel will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

23. **Declarations of Interest**

There were no declarations of interest made by Members in accordance with the code of conduct.

24. **Chair's Urgent Business**

There were no items of Chair's urgent business.

25. **Appointment of Vice Chair**

The Committee agreed to appoint Councillor Fletcher as Vice Chair for this particular meeting.

26. **Call-In: Decision Reference ES05 18/19 (The City of Plymouth (Traffic Regulation Orders) (Amendment No. 2018.2137185 - Connaught Avenue, College Avenue, Mannamead Road, Mutley Plain and Torr Lane) Order, a decision which is in support of the B3350 Mannamead Road Junctions Improvement Scheme (Decision Ref: SDPI 01 18/19), part of the Northern Corridor Transport Scheme (Decisions Ref: L14 15/16)**

The Performance, Finance and Customer Focus Overview and Scrutiny Committee considered the call-in of the executive decision - Decision Reference ES05 18/19 (The City of Plymouth (Traffic Regulation Orders) (Amendment No. 2018.2137185 - Connaught Avenue, College Avenue, Mannamead Road, Mutley Plain and Torr Lane) Order, a decision which is in support of the B3350 Mannamead Road Junctions Improvement Scheme (Decision Ref: SDPI 01 18/19), part of the Northern Corridor Transport Scheme (Decisions Ref: L14 15/16).

The Committee heard that –

(a) Councillors Ball, Johnson and Kelly had called in the decision for the following reasons -

- the traffic flow into Mutley Plain from the north was high in the early morning and diminished through the day negating the proposal's reasons for a complete removal of the parking spaces;
- congestion which restricted traffic flow on Mutley Plain would not be changed by removal of these parking spaces, they were the result of other physical restrictions which were articulated by objectors during the consultation;
- enforcement of the parking spaces could be improved by the installation of metering.

(b) Councillors Ball and Johnson considered that -

- the 13 car parking spaces were crucial for the viability of the businesses located on Mannamead Road and should this decision be implemented this would further exacerbate the economic decline of Mutley Plain;
- the removal of the car parking spaces would not make a significant difference to the traffic flow, as there were a number of physical restrictions along Mutley Plain which included the right hand turn into Ford Park Road;
- a change in the time restrictions for these parking spaces would negate the need to remove them;
- no due attention had been given when considering this scheme, as to the impact that it would have on businesses (the service sector businesses in this area had informed

Councillor Ball that leases would not be renewed in light of this decision which would further effect other sector related businesses);

- whether the improvement in the journey times would be worth the loss of 10 or more business;
- (c) Councillor Dann (Cabinet Member for Environment and Street Scene), Councillor Coker (Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning and Infrastructure), Sally Farley (Strategic Transport Manager), Robin Bevan (Transport Planning Officer) and Darren Stoneman (Civil Enforcement Manager) responded that –
- the Mannamead Road Junction Improvements Scheme was the second scheme within the Northern Corridor Junction Improvements Programme; the project would upgrade signals, improve pedestrian and cycle facilities and provide a shared lane for pedestrian/cycle link between the Torr Lane and Manadon junctions;
 - the presence of the on-street parking bays reduced capacity to a single lane at the point where it entered the dualled section at Mutley Plain, resulting in frequent congestion on the approach to Mutley Plain with queues often extending back past Elm Road; south bound traffic flow on Mannamead Road was high throughout the day (750 vehicles per hour at 8am reducing to 600 vehicles per hour during the day and rising again to over 700 vehicles per hour from around 4pm);
 - the traffic modelling demonstrated that there would be significant benefit in both the morning and evening peak periods, mainly as a result of the removal of parking (a 44 second journey time saving per vehicle south bound in the morning peak and 30 seconds saving in the evening peak);
 - the scheme would not improve the delays that occurred on Mutley Plain, as the congestion was due to a variety of downstream factors (which were outside of the scope of the Mannamead Road scheme); however the detailed traffic flow modelling had demonstrated that there were significant benefits in removing the car parking spaces;

- the installation of parking meters would not prevent illegal parking during the restricted times of the day; in order to prevent this from occurring the civil enforcement team would need to make multiple visits throughout the longer restricted periods thus placing a significant additional burden on the enforcement team;
 - mitigating measures had been included as part of the scheme to address any potential impact of the loss of parking spaces, as follows –
 - ▶ the provision of additional space for approximately eight cars to park on College Avenue and Connaught Avenue (for one hour) which would result in the net loss of approximately five spaces;
 - ▶ the relaxation of the restrictions in the parking bay on Mutley Plain near Tesco Express which would allow vehicles to park for one hour from 8am until 8pm instead of 9.15am and 3.45pm;
 - ▶ the Mutley Barracks public car park has been made free to use for one hour during the day and from 8pm until 8am; as part of the scheme new signage would be installed directing people to this car park which was very close to the existing parking spaces on Mannamead Road;
- (d) the main points arising from the Committee debating the call-in included -
- following the mitigating measures included as part of the scheme to address the loss of the 13 car park spaces, why was it considered that the eight additional spaces being provided in College Avenue and Connaught Avenue would not be adequate and why was it more important to retain the spaces rather than deliver a strategic project;
 - why the service lane (Mutley Plain Lane) was not adequate to serve the loading needs of the businesses potentially affected by the loss of the car parking spaces and the change to the loading bay on Connaught Avenue;

- how confident were officers that the traffic flow model used for this scheme was right for this location;
- as the Heart of the South West Local Enterprise Partnership had part funded the scheme, would the Council's reputation be damaged or its ability to gain further funding be impacted should this part of the scheme not be progressed;
- whether pedestrian access had been considered as part of the scheme;
- the rationale behind wishing to improve journey times by 44 seconds rather than protecting the economic viability of Mutley Plain;
- whether consideration had been given to narrowing the pavement, in order to create car parking spaces adjacent to the highway (Mannamead Road);
- reassurance that the additional car parking spaces in College Avenue and Connaught Avenue would be effectively enforced;
- the possibility of increasing the free car parking in the Mutley Barracks public car park from one hour to three which would be in line with other community car parks such as Crownhill;
- whether there was a breakdown of where the consultation letters had been sent ie residential, businesses or other;
- how confident were officers that the traffic flow modelling for the scheme would deliver the 44 seconds journey time saving per vehicle (south bound).

The Committee agreed to confirm that the decision should be implemented with immediate effect.